



## **DISTINGUISHING THE ROLE OF SUFI SAINTS IN COMMUNITY RESILIENCE TO VIOLENT EXTREMISM IN SINDH**

Dr Nabi Bakhsh Narejo\*

Department of Criminology, University of Sindh, Jamshoro

Email: [chair.crim@usindh.edu.pk](mailto:chair.crim@usindh.edu.pk)

Abdul Hameed Mahesar

Department of Criminology, University of Sindh, Jamshoro

### **Abstract**

This study explores the unique tradition and practice of Sufism in Sindh. The study is enriched with the qualitative data of the participants (twenty in total) having thorough expertise on the subject-matter of the Sufism of Sindh. It explores the distinguishing role of the sufi saints in Community Resilience to violent extremism in Sindh. The thematic analysis technique was applied to highlight the findings of the research. The Sufism of Sindh is very unique, homogenous, all-inclusive and universal in its characteristics. The teachings of Bhattae, Sachal and Qalandar are instrumental learning for the common people from various communities. The Music, kalam, rhythm and dance are the key medium of the sufi saints having healing spiritual powers for followers. There is increasing role of Academia, Media, Culture, Aukaf and Embassies to popularize the peace and resilient message of the sufi saints of Sindh who built strong ideological walls for communities fighting against violent extremism. It is high time to strengthen and promote the unique message of these Sufis of Sindh locally, nationally and globally so that peace goals of world communities can be successfully achieved.

**Key Words:** Sufism, Resilience, Sufi Saint, Music, Violent Extremism

## **Introduction**

This study generally explores the Sufism prevailing in Sindh province. More particularly it deals with the Sufi Saints' role in Community Resilience to Violent Extremism in Sindh. Sufism is a philosophy and an approach parallel to the religions. This study is a dynamic effort to find out the role of sufi saints of Sindh in making communities resilient against violent extremism in Sindh. The sufi saints of Sindh have been leading historically in community resilience to violent extremism in Sindh and beyond. Their thoughts, works, music and dance have always attracted common people of Sindh towards their peaceful message. Islamic Sufism is very unique in its approach, philosophy and impact on the people. Islamic traditions are full of tolerance, human examples of mutual-respect and co-existence as a way of life. We also find assertions of peace and brotherhood and human peace if we study other world religions like Buddhism and other religions.

It is historically practiced in Sindh throughout centuries. Sufism is a living tradition and practice loved by the common men in Sindh. Sufi saints of Sindh, more specifically Bhattae, Sachal and Qalander Shahbaz, have been the leading social leaders. The people from different communities have been following Sufi thought and practice in Sindh. The sufi tradition of Sindh and its practice by the people of communities makes people stronger ideologically against terrorism and extremism.

This study explores the ways and means used by the Sufi saints in making communities powerful/strengthened against the challenges and threats of violent extremism. This is a qualitative study having very bold approach to address the research problem. The study would be great leap forward in social science research with immense prospects. The study aims to explore the issue by conducting the qualitative interviews with the participants of the related field.

## **Objectives**

1. To understand the tradition/approach of Sufism of Sindh and its role in community resilience to violent extremism in Sindh.
2. To understand the crux of the message of the sufi saints and the way they influence the common men from different communities.
3. To analyze the medium, tools, and icons of the Sufi Saints of Sindh and their connection to shaping common peoples' perceptions of peace and non-violence.
4. To distinguish the unique role of Sufi saints (Bhittae, Sachal and Qalandar) in Community Resilience to violent extremism in Sindh.

## **Background**

Sindh has been very peaceful province historically but it has been vulnerable to foreign attacks and negative influences tarnishing its peaceful image. This study explores the role of the Sufi Saints in communities of Sindh resilient to violent extremism. The majority of communities in Sindh have been staunch believers in Sufism. Thus Sufi poets in Sindh have lot of intense following among communities in Sindh. The Sufi poets have influenced minds and narratives of the people and communities living in Sindh since centuries. The poetry of Sufis, music, and culture of shrines and mellas have impacted communities to a greater extent. Despite radicalization and foreign influences Sindh has sustained its peaceful image. In past decades and years the terrorists have attacked shrines and Sufi places but they have been quite unsuccessful in breaking Sufi bonds of Sufi Saints with communities. The defeat of violent extremism in fact started with terrorists' attacking the Sufi shrines in Sindh.

It is significant to search how Sufi poetry makes community resilient. Secondly, it further investigates how Sufi music plays the role in making Sufi community resilient to violent extremism. Besides, it measures qualitatively the characteristics of community resilience to violent extremism.

If we critically overview the history, Sindh has remained the soil of peace, love, brotherhood, communal and religious harmony. However, the wars, foreign attacks and influences have been very substantial in impacting the social fabric, life and culture of Sindhi society. Shah Latif Bhittai has remained the crown of Sufi Saints who always talked of humanity, peace, patriotism, tolerance and love for the poor and the oppressed. Bhittai through his poetry and Sufi music stressed the prosperity of Sindh and livelihood of world humanity.

Hazrat Sachal Sarmast, situated in Daraza in Ranipur has been second leading Sufi Saints having greatest community of followers in Sindh, other provinces of Pakistan and across the world. Sachal Sarmast's poetry is written in seven languages/dialects. It is beautifully sung by Sufi singers for the pleasure of the Sufi community. Hazrat Lal Shahbaz Qalandar of Sehwan has been the pivotal Saint of Sindh having his community of followers in Sindh, Pakistan and outside world. Thus, Bhittai, Qalandar and Sachal form three main pillars of Sufism in Sindh, besides others, keeping their followers peaceful.

This study carries the tremendous weightage in qualitatively exploring the theme of Sufism and its role in Communities' Resilience to Violent Extremism. This theme is very new and challengingly significant in the context of Sindh, Pakistan. This research endeavor would boost social science research and professional networking throughout Pakistan and the rest of the world connecting the key academicians, fellow researchers, practitioners, policymakers and program implementers.

There are exceptionally few researches on Sufi Saints of Sindh and researches on Sufism and its determining role in community resilience to violent extremism are non-existing. Michel Boivin (2015) explored the notion of Sufism in his historical and anthropological research on Sufi shrines like Sehwan Sharif. Since then, Michel Boivin has been pursuing several lines of research, most having to do with the notion of Sufism. This reflection has been enriched by long-term fieldwork conducted in the holy town of Sehwan Sharif, where the sanctuary of Lal Shahbaz Qalandar is located. From 2008 to 2011 he conducted research on Qalandar in space context.

This study, at the start, examines the Sufism in Sindh and how it helps forming communities' peace narrative to violent extremism. It is assumed that Sufism and the Sufi Saints of Sindh have great real role in making and maintaining the communities resilient to violent extremism. There is significant process of spiritual bonding involved. So, Sufi bonding is presumed following the theoretical tradition of Travis Hirsch (1969). The Sufi Saints play the role/function of leaders of spiritual communities. Besides, there is very important linking factor of how Sufi music strengthens the Sufi bond contributing further significantly to communities' resilience to violent extremism.

.The present research would broaden thematic diversity and enrich the body of researched knowledge on Communities' Resilience to Violent Extremism. This would help advice the governments, NGO's and other concerned bodies besides educating common masses nationally, locally and globally. The study would also contribute towards generating valuable data for Home Department, Auqaf and Culture Departments besides academic and research institutions. Research on Sufi Saints and their resilient role for communities against violent extremism are very rare in the context of Sindh. However, in last decades there is a growing policy push towards searching community and regional peace by unconventional ways.

### **Literature Review**

Sindh through centuries had been the abode of peace. Levesque (2016) has been very vocal and clear regarding the sufism of Sindh. In the article Levesque says, "Sindhis are sufis by nature". (Levesque,2016)

Sindh has been the land of the peace throughout the ages. This secret lies in the teachings of sufi saints who have been living there. The sufism of Sindh had been amazingly rich with traditions of human love, tolerance and respect. The sufi practices of Sindh, being influenced by the traditions of Islam, Hinduism, Buddhism and other religions, are very rich and powerfully convincing regarding peace, tolerance and human co-existence.

The above said unique characteristics of Sindh and its Sufism provide its population with strengths and capabilities to confront terrorism, violence and extremism through peaceful means. This can be viewed from the fact that Sindh's communities tend to be resilient enough against the violent extremism. For the sufi saints of Sindh namely Shah Abdul Latif Bhittai, Sachal

Sarmast and Qalandar Lal Shahbaz, stabilize and make the communities resilient against the violent extremism through their sufi teachings.

Community Resilience to Violent Extremism can be seen and defined in variety of ways. It consists of creating community capacities, strengths and bonds which keep communities intact and resourceful in community disasters .The governments are highly concerned and prepared in their strategies towards urban and rural communities in strengthening their natural bonds for fighting effectively in social disasters .The top to bottom and bottom to top approaches have been revised. The community resilience has short term and long term dimensions and benefits. (Chandra et al, 2013).

Moreover, terrorism and violent extremism has been observed as the greatest threat to human civilizations, urban communities and settlements of human societies. The terrorist groups and organizations are highly organized threats and there arises the need of secure and well-connected communities to effectively counter the violent threats in modern times. (Homeland Security Committee, 2016). Violent extremism takes many forms and includes all those who “support or commit ideologically-motivated violence to further political goals” (The White House, Office of the Press Secretary, 2011b, p. 1).

Likewise, Violent Extremism can be seen in modern times as one of the manifestation of terrorism associated with the people who are extremists in their ideologies, approaches and actions against their opponents or the armed forces. These radicalized people are motivated to kill their opponents including members of armed forces. They aim to bring about change by radicalized means and methods. They are the criminally oriented groups who have the negative mind sets to inflict violence and bring radicalized change. They have specific traits and characteristics besides the violent and non-violent radicalization can be differentiated (Barletta and Miller 2012).Werbner (2010) has been leading in suggesting anthropological approaches towards understanding the cultural dissidence in relation to Countering Violent Extremism. The religious groups and movements which are radicalized survive in forms of religious nationalism moved by mediated global crises (2010, p.193).Extremism is characterized by ultimate intolerance and uncompromising setting aside of the concern for human coexistence (Berthelsen 2013).It is universal and intense desire for the individual and social changes where concern for human coexistence is set aside (Berthelsen 2016).

Agnew (2002) has criticized the use of wider research frames for Violent Extremism related research. Agnew wanted to be more specific. These approaches would fail to know the motivations behind extremism or terrorism. Hirsch-Heiferette al., (2014) revealed that Israelis and Palestinians exposed to political violence would feel psychological distress and believe in peaceful resolution of the revolution. The violent extremist groups may use extralegal methods and mechanisms for achieving ideological goals. There exists legal cynicism that justifies use of violent extremism. Neutralization theory predicts the support for violent extremism.

The “bystander effect” has been identified as a key barrier to identifying and intervening with individuals seeking to engage in violent extremism; in an examination of lone-actor terrorists, 64% of the time friends or families were aware of an individual’s intentions to carry out a violent act (Gill, Horgan, & Deckert, 2014). While there are multiple explanations for why these “bystanders” failed to take steps to alert authorities to potential risk, Williams, Horgan, and Evans (2015) found that key reasons for not disclosing information about a potential violent extremism threat were concerns that the disclosure would get a friend/family member in trouble (as opposed to providing help) and potential ramifications from within the community itself.

### **Methodology**

This study is exploratory in nature. It employed the qualitative approach to study the teachings of the Sufi Saints of Sindh. This study was primarily interview based which has been used by social anthropologists and ethnographers leadingly like Marshall and Rossman (1989) who used these data tools because of nature of their inquiry and observation which required "the systematic description of events, behaviors, and artifacts in the social setting chosen for study" (p.79).

### **Study location**

The location or setting of this study was Sindh province. The geographical focus was in the areas where shrines of Hazrat Lal Shahbaz Qalandar Sehwan), Hazrat Shah Abdul Latif Bhittai (Bhitt Shah), and Hazrat Sachal Sarmast (Daraza Khairpur Mirus). The participants of the study were recruited from these areas.

### **Sample size**

It is quite important to select a sample size in order to determine the number of participants in this study. After fulfilling our purpose, we limit the size of the sample due to reaching at the saturation point. In this research, 20 interviews were conducted from the key participants.

### **The Sample Selection**

The sample selection is one of the most significant parts of the qualitative research. The researcher selects the sample on the basis of a certain criteria which is suitable for understanding the understudied phenomenon. In this research, participants were selected through snowball sampling. The researcher doesn't have the direct access to the participants or had less idea about their location, demographic information, and relevant expertise. Therefore, while accessing the first participant, we asked from other participants. We got information from the people, or they often hinted us for other participants for this research. After that, we tried to access others, in this way we met with relevant participants. We were successful in conducting interviews from the key participants who were directly or indirectly attached through their believers, experienced persons, followers, singers, Sufis, Gadi Nasheen (care takers) and literary people. We included them due to their relevant experience, knowledge, education, and expertise. We had conducted more than 20 interviews, but we excluded some of the participants due to the repetition of ideas, knowledge and concept or we reached to a saturation point.

### **Data collection**

The data were collected through interview method. The in depth interviews were conducted with participants. Before conducting of interviews, the permission was sought by obtaining informed consent. The average duration of interviews lasted for 30 to 50 minutes. The interviews were recorded on audio device. The study engages the qualitative participant interview method of data collection.

Twenty (20) interviews of participants were conducted in the field. The participants were well experienced and knowledgeable persons such as sufi poets, researchers, writers, singers and followers. The participants of the research were accessed exactly after learning from the snow ball technique

The following interview guide was used:

1. How do you see/ define the Sufism prevailing in Sindh?
2. What is the crux of the message of the Sufi Saints regarding community resilience to violent extremism in Sindh?
3. What were the means, methods, and modes of the Sufi Saints for reaching to the common men?
4. How far the Sufi Saints were successful in community resilience to violent extremism?

These were the main questions however the probes were also put to initiate the deep discussion on the said questions. The probing was considered as tool to generate rich data.

### **Data management and analysis**

The recorded interviews were transcribed verbatim. The transcription and data collection went on simultaneously. It means the researcher transcribed interviews in the field. It helped to furnish the interview guide and overcome shortcomings. The transcripts were analyzed by using Thematic Analysis technique developed by Braun and Clarke (2006). The coding process was done on the transcripts and a separate code book was developed. The codes generated themes. The thematic analysis was done manually.

### **Reliability**

The initial transcripts were shared with some of the participants so that the trustworthiness of data might be ensured. This is called the member check in qualitative research. The principal investigator and the co-PI jointly worked on analysis to have sharpness of the analysis process.

### **Methodological limitations**

This study used participant observation. Further, the findings of this study may not be generalized because of the nature of the study as being qualitative. The participants were limited to the above-mentioned categories of caretakers, Sufi singers, and Sufi scholars because there is scarcity of expertise of people on the topic of this study.

### **Technical/Social/Ethical Considerations/Approvals**

The study involves conducting interviews with participants. It would be ensured to get permission from the participants where necessary. The researcher would be aware and prepared to issues related to security, considerations of social ethics and cultural sensitivities.

The professional requirements and legal guidelines must be followed. The University or the organization awarding project may provide the written permission for such research so that it can be shown to people who may inquire.

The manner and style of talking to the participants matter a lot in this context. There requires calculated adjustments in verbal communication and written questionnaire. Every care must be made to judge and plan about the contingent plan about unseen issues arising during the data collection. The experience, knowledge of culture and awareness of sensitivity of the topic and participants must be critically engaged getting responses cordially.

### **Analysis/Results**

#### **1. Originality and Unique features of Sufism in Sindh**

The Sufism of Sindh is unique in its thought. Its influence touches human minds and souls. The believers and followers are bonded in such approach making them part of the sufi wujud (body).

The Sufi tradition found in Sindh is highly unique in its character approach and appeal to humanity. The Sufism of Sindh may look imported, but its true essence lies in its indigenous nature. The Sufi Saints of Sindh were genuinely connected to the values of the soil, richness of communities and selfless love for the homeland.

The Sufi Saints developed its separate following of the common people beyond religious affiliation or social class differences. The Sufi Saints of Sindh were not party to the contemporary ruling elites but helped common men in raising voice against all types of social inequalities, oppression and violence.

The researcher and literary writer said, "Sufis believed in remembrance of Allah in its truest sense. Shah Inayat Shah, Bhattae Sachal Qalander Shahbaz and Bedal Sain are the leading Sufi Saints of Sindh. They are Shahbaz (the eagle) Lamakan (beyond time and space) of Sindh.

Bhittae's *Kalam* is advice oriented and Sachal's *Kalam* is *Mansoori* and *Sarmadi*. He believed in *Anna'l Haq* (I am the Truth).

The leading Sufi Saints especially Qalander Lal Shahbaz, Shah Abdul Latif Bhittae and Sachal Sarmast were the genius of their times. They helped spread and strengthen Islam in Sindh and beyond. Their impact on society, its culture and common people is huge and deep. The people followed these Sufi Saints as their parallel social leaders opposite to the rulers and the powerful religious clergy of the contemporary times. These Sufi Saints produced unparalleled Sufi thought resulting in developing a Sufi narrative of peace for the common, poor and oppressed sections of society. Their *kalam* was popularized by the medium of Sufi music, charismatic rhythm and heart-moving dance.

## **2. Oneness of Allah as the foundation of Sufism in Sindh**

The sufism of Sindh believes in Allah alone. The sufi practices promote unity and harmony of humanity. The Sufi Saints of Sindh were strong believers and propagators of oneness of Allah. They strived to seek Allah in true inner soul. Their philosophy was true to the essence of Islam. This further led to develop the concept of oneness of human brotherhood. The Sufi Saints' message is relevant to individuals and diverse communities found all over the globe. The humanity is the common theme for the Sufism in vogue in Sindh throughout centuries of historical traditions. As one of the participant says "Mysticism of Islam believes in one Ummah which is unified by staunch believers".

## **3. The Sufis promoted Liberal Tradition and Practice**

Islamic sufism promoted liberalism of thought and freedom of action. The Sufi Saints of Sindh imported the cultural traditions and re-cultivated their own Sufi values more indigenous to taste of soil and demands of the people. They enhanced personal human freedom and its expression in a fearless and selfless style. Consequently, they came in intellectual argument with the contemporary religious clergy. Their message was highly vocal, powerful and appealing to the people at large. The people were highly moved towards the Sufi Saints developing a spiritual relationship and an unbreakable bond.

Following the tradition of Islam, the Sufi Saints promoted moderate values in society. They encouraged growth of ethical values of society based on Islamic foundations. The *kalam* (content) of the Sufi Saints was self-evident speaking high of the value system upheld by the leading Sufis in Sindh.

The participant said “The sufi tradition and practice involves common people to visit shrine, involve in sufi rag, participate in dance connected with patterns of rhythm Sufism is getting rid of impurities of human body and purification of the soul”.

#### **4. Sufism as bond between Sufi Saints and common men**

The Sufi Saints of Sindh were very near to the people by their down-to- earth connection heartily and spiritually. The role of the *Dargah* (shrine) was very significant as pathway of communicating, following and converting the people as true Sufi practitioners. The respondent who was a practicing Sufi singer said “Sufi Saints are the spiritual healers of the spiritual illness”.

Sufism is the theme of humanity and human relation. It produces fear of Allah. People memorize by heart the whole *Kalam* of Bhattae which shows their commitment to Sufi Saints. The participant who was a practicing sufi singer said “Tasawuf is a flowing river. It is knowledge beyond boundaries and limits. Sufism of Bhattae is crafted keeping in view the cultural values, customs and traditions of people of Sindh. Sufism of Bhattae cannot be disconnected from people, land and patriotism. Bhattae and Qalandar adopted music and rhythm as icons and tools of conveying their message Sufis have diagnosed the spiritual dilemma of common men and provided the healing medicine. Tasawf is science of the soul”.

#### **5. All-inclusive and Universal Essence of the Sufi Message**

The Sufi Saints disseminated their philosophy by educating the people beyond caste, creed and cultural differences and classes. Their thought and continued practices nurtured pluralism, universal moral and cultural value systems with heterogeneous context of the societies and communities found on the face of the globe.

The participant said “The alphabet of Sufism is submission before spiritual leader. Sufism teaches humbleness of character. Tasawf is not a religion but a unique humanistic approach and idealism.

The respondent said, “Sufism is like spiritual science which can utilized universally for making and maintaining peace, order and human welfare”. As Bulle Shah says “I have learned the art of flying in the air. I am looking forward to reach to stars”. The Sufi singer said, “The Sufi Saints were having treasure of immense knowledge that they tried to spread to common men”.

### **6. Rag, Instrument, Rhythm and Dance**

Sachal Sarmast led Sindh being the chief poet of *Kafi* form in which *kalwaro* (a peculiar fast rhythm beat) was used musically to move people to *Wajid* and dance. Sachal Sarmast was a slogan-oriented poet. “I do not say I am truth. My friend says I say I am truth”. The interviewee said, “Sachal Sarmast during Samah of Music used to dance raising slogans of Inal Haq. During that dance Sachal used to weep. Sachal invented *Kafi* as mode to make people dance”. One respondent said, “The Sufi practice of Sachal Sarmast attracted me because it was based on submission, humbleness and mutual respect”.

Another respondent who himself is Sufi classical singer said. “Sindhi *Kalwaro* is the special invention and innovation of Sindh Sufi music. It creates *wajid* in people”. Bhattae created an indigenous music.

### **7. Bhattae, Sachal and Qalandar being Leading Sufis of Community Resilience to Violent extremism**

There were participants with richness of data about the researched theme. One scholar had his own views about the Sufi Saints of Sindh. He said, “The Sufi Saints were continuation of the tradition of slavery already in practice in Sindh. They did nothing to contribute towards the relief or welfare of the common men of Sindh”.

The participant said “Bhittae’s poetry is learned by heart by many people in Sindh is an evidence/proof how people love him. The people infact narrate themselves by quoting Bhittae. People are peace-loving because the sufi poet has taught a lesson of peace to them “:.

Another participant who was a practicing Sufi singer said, “The Sufi Saints in Sindh have always spread the message of love, peace, tolerance and mutual co-existence. The common men have been benefited from the message of the Sufis to a greater extent. However, some sectors of communities have benefited more or less. Some elements still have involved in violence out of hatred or lack of awareness of the Sufi message”.

## **Discussion**

The tradition of Sufism spreading in Asian sub-continent ushered in 11 th century. There were classic and medieval periods besides growth of Islamic mysticism. The Sufism of Sindh is unique as it combines the multiple colors. The Sufism of Sindh (popularized by Bhittae) combines the essence of Samatra, Ved tradition and Buddhism besides having the fragrance of the soil and culture of Indus Civilization.

The period of stay of Qalandar in Sindh is not more than a year but the impact is instrumental. The sufi tradition of Bhittae is like that of Rumi. Sachal was more vocal and open while expressing the truth. Because of agricultural fertileland, huge river water system, Sindh had always been the land of prosperity. The people of Sindh had no tradition or history of attacking others.

The debate of non-violence is quite tricky as Sufis only cannot ensure full peace besides mass popular liberal/rational movements. The extremism and irrational violence can be checked by Sufis besides parallel factors of social and political justice.

The teachings of the sufi saints have been playing the key role in educating people against violent extremism. The sufi saints became popular medium of peace. They promoted the narrative or ideology of tolerance and human co-existence.

## **Conclusion**

This study is a qualitative research endeavor to explore the distinguishing role of the sufi saints in community resilience to violent extremism in Sindh. The twenty participant experts were interviewed and their data is thematically analyzed. The richness of the data is key in framing the valuable research recommendations.

The study concludes that the sufi tradition and practice of Sindh is quite unique in its approach. The Sufism of Sindh, led by Bhattae, Sachal and Qalandar, promotes humanism, homogeneity and universal values through popular practice of sufi music (rag), rhythm and dance. The Sufi music rhythm and dance are the modes of making people to bond themselves with Sufi Saints' approach. The people become staunch followers of the Sufi leaders. The people of communities follow the sufi practice as medium of peace and tolerance. There is growing need to involve in such studies so that community peace can be ensured globally.

The Sufi Saints of Sindh were greatest genius of their times who produced highly valuable literature of wisdom in poetic diction which was popularly sung by the Sufi singers reaching to local people and outside world equally and vehemently. As one respondent said, the Sufi Saints were the spiritual healers of human maladies and diseases. They were connected actively with highly poor people and vulnerable pockets of communities through the bond formed by love, patriotism, equality and fair human attitudes and behaviors. This shaped the common peoples' narratives of peace against violence, oppressive rulers and cruel sections of society.

The Sufi Saints brought a separate model agenda and program of common men's' welfare and uplift. This resulted in making people peaceful discouraging growth of extremism and its ideological grounds. The Sufi Saints also discouraged promoting the revolutionary approaches in society besides making some ideal ideological and structural changes. They were also the greatest social reformists of their times. The Sufi Saints' disseminated all-inclusive message of one humanity discouraging all types of differences, discriminations and social prejudices. The Sufi Saints ideally created homogeneity out of heterogeneity and singularity from multiple communities, nations and geographical entities.

## **Recommendations**

In the end, this study comes up with the following general recommendations:

- The message, music and dance of the Sufi saints promote sense of collectiveness among communities. Global communities may be strengthened following the Sufi tradition and practice in Sindh.
- The message of Bhattae, Sachal and Qalandar may be strengthened, promoted, and popularized so that world communities may effectively benefit from them.
- The cultural and ambassadorial efforts may be focused to organize national and international seminars on the theme of Sufism and community resilience to violent extremism.
- The teachings, poetry, music and Sufi practices of Bhattae, Sachal and Qalandar need to be incorporated into curricula of schools, colleges and universities at national levels so that the common people may benefit from it.
- The effort should be made to initiate Cultural Exchange programmes to spread the message of the Sufi Saints of Sindh especially the leading Sufis. The embassies should be engaged in promoting such contacts and visits helping to know and disseminate the Sufi message of peace and community tolerance.
- The Media, Aukaf and Culture departments must be geared up promoting and publicizing the Sufi message of peace nationally and globally. Culture department of Government of Sindh should organize cultural shows, seminars, and conferences on Sufi saints of Sindh.
- The religious scholars and academia are the vital institutions which can promote the unique Sufi practices/teachings nationally and globally. Religious scholars be made aware of the key message of Sufism so that they may make it part of their holy sermons. University of Sufism in Bhitshah must take responsibility to further promote, advance and globalize the message of Sufi practices of the leading Sufi saints of Sindh.

- More academic research is needed on the key areas of Sufism, Sufi music, and its connectivity with peace making and conflict resolution. The experts, researchers and academicians must explore Sufis of Sindh with more realistic and community-based point of view. Our model of Sufism may be truly projected all over the globe. More studies connecting Sufism and community resilience are needed in future. The conflicts and regional disputes may be avoided emulating the example of the Sufis of Sindh.

## References

A. Zeiger & A. Aly (Eds.), *Countering violent extremism: Developing an evidence-base for policy and practice* (pp. 139–144). Perth, Western Australia, Australia: Curtin University.

Agnew, Robert. 2002. "Experienced, Vicarious, and Anticipated Strain: An Exploratory Study on Victimization and Delinquency." *Justice Quarterly* 19:603–32. [Google Scholar](#) | [Crossref](#) | [ISI](#)

Agnew, Robert. 2010. "A General Strain Theory of Terrorism." *Theoretical Criminology* 14:131–53. [Google Scholar](#) | [SAGE Journals](#) | [ISI](#)

Bandura, Albert. 1986. *Social Foundations of Thought and Action: A Social Cognitive Theory*. Englewood Cliffs, NJ: Prentice Hall. [Google Scholar](#)

Bandura, Albert, Barbaranelli, Claudio, Caprara, Gian Vittorio, Pastorelli, Concetta. 1996. "Mechanisms of Moral Disengagement in the Exercise of Moral Agency." *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology* 71:364–74. [Google Scholar](#) | [Crossref](#) | [ISI](#)

Bartlett, J., & Miller, C. (2012). The edge of violence: Towards telling the difference between violent and non-violent radicalization. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 24, 1–21. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/09546553.2011.594923>

Bartlett, J., & Miller, C. (2012). The edge of violence: Towards telling the difference between violent and nonviolent radicalization. *Terrorism and Political Violence*, 24, 121.

Berthelsen, P. (2012), Intentional activity and free will as core concepts in criminal law and psychology, *Theory and Psychology*, 22 (1) s. 44-66

Berthelsen, P. (2013), Mentoring in anti-radicalization LTG: a systematic assessment, intervention and supervision tool in mentoring.

Bertelsen, P. (2015), Danish preventive measures and de-radicalization strategies. The Aarhus Model, *Panorama*,

Chandra, A., Williams, M., Plough, A., Stayton, A., Wells, K. B., Horta, M., & Tang, J. (2013). Getting actionable about community resilience: The Los Angeles County Community Disaster Resilience project. *American Journal of Public Health*, 103, 1181–1189.<http://dx.doi.org/10.2105/AJPH.2013.301270>.

DeWalt, Kathleen M. & DeWalt, Billie R. (1998). Participant observation. In H. Russell Bernard (Ed.), *Handbook of methods in cultural anthropology* (pp.259-300). Walnut Creek: AltaMira Press

DeWalt, Kathleen M. DeWalt, Billie R. (2002). *Participant observation: a guide for fieldworkers*. Walnut Creek, CA: AltaMira Press.

Gill, P., Horgan, J., & Deckert, P. (2014). Bombing Alone: Tracing the Motivations and Antecedent Behaviors of Lone- Actor Terrorists. *Journal of forensic sciences*, 59(2), 425-435.

Hirsch-Hoefler, S., Canetti, D., Rapaport, C., & Hobfoll, S. E. (in press). Conflict will harden your heart: Exposure to violence, psychological distress, and peace barriers in Israel and Palestine. *British Journal of Political Science*.

Hirschi, T. (1969). A control theory of delinquency. *Criminology theory: Selected classic readings*, 1969, 289-305.

Homeland Security Committee. (2016). Final report of the task force on combating terrorist and foreign fighter travel. New York, NY: Skyhorse Publishing

Julien Levesque, ‘‘Sindhis are Sufi by nature’’: Sufism as a marker of identity in Sindh’, in Deepra Dandekar & Torsten Tschacher (eds.), *Islam, Sufism and Everyday Politics of Belonging in South Asia*, London: Routledge, 2016, p. 212-227, ISBN: 9781138910683

Marshall, Catherine & amp; Rossman, Gretchen B. (1989). *Designing qualitative research*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Marshall, Catherine & amp; Rossman, Gretchen B. (1995). *Designing qualitative research*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Michel Bovion (2014). *Historical dictionary of the Sufi culture of Sindh in Pakistan and India*. Oxford university press

Preben Berthelsen (2016). *Violent radicalization and extremism A review of risk factors and a theoretical model of radicalization*

The White House, Office of the Press Secretary. (2011b). *Strategic implementation plan for Empowering local partners to prevent violent extremism in the United States*. Retrieved from <https://www.whitehouse.gov/sites/default/files/sip-final.pdf>

*Violent Extremism in the 21st Century: International Perspectives* edited by Gwyneth Overland, Arnfinn J. Andersen, Kristin Engh Førde

Werbner, P. (2010). Notes from a small place: Anthropological blues in the face of global terror. *Current Anthropology*, 51(2), 193–221

Williams, M. J., Horgan, J. G., & Evans, W. P. (2015). Research summary: Lessons from a U.A. study revealing the critical role of “gatekeepers” in public safety networks for countering Violent Extremism.